

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

OCMIAN 3335  
CONFIDENTIAL  
OO PRETO  
FM FCOLN TO PRETO  
301130Z JUL  
GRS 1873

*Please file.  
Ch*

CONFIDENTIAL  
FM FCO  
TO IMMEDIATE PRETORIA  
TELNO 193  
OF 301130Z JULY 86

FROM PRIVATE SECRETARY

SECRETARY OF STATE'S MEETING WITH P W BOTHA: 29 JULY  
SUMMARY

1. A VERY DIFFICULT AND AT TIMES STORMY MEETING. THE SECRETARY OF STATE URGED THE CASE FOR DIALOGUE WITH LEADERS OF ALL COMMUNITIES AND THE NEED FOR THE SAG TO FIND THE COURAGE TO MAKE IT POSSIBLE FOR ALL SECTIONS OF THE COMMUNITY TO PARTICIPATE. P W BOTHA MAINTAINED THAT THE WORLD WAS JUDGING SOUTH AFRICA BY DOUBLE STANDARDS. NO RECOGNITION OF ROLE PLAYED BY US/UK IN HOLDING OFF SANCTIONS. HE WOULD DEAL WITH MANDELA HIMSELF IN HIS OWN TIME, AND WOULD RELEASE HIM ONLY IF HE ABANDONED VIOLENCE: THE ANC MUST FREE THEMSELVES FROM COMMUNIST INFLUENCE BEFORE HE WOULD DEAL WITH THEM. HE CHALLENGED THE WORLD TO APPLY SANCTIONS AGAINST SOUTH AFRICA.

DETAIL

2. AFTER INITIAL COURTESIES, PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT THE SECRETARY OF STATE CLAIMED THE SAG HAD THE KEY TO PROGRESS: NOW THE WORLD WANTED TO TAKE IT AWAY. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT WHAT WAS NEEDED AS A FURTHER DISPLAY OF THE COURAGE WHICH THE SAG HAD ALREADY SHOWN IN

1

CONFIDENTIAL

*STARTING*

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

STARTING TO MAKE CHANGES. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT HE HAD LOST FAITH IN THE WESTERN COMMUNITY, WHICH WAS CONSTANTLY PICKING ON SOUTH AFRICA. HE THEN PRODUCED A PREPARED LIST OF QUESTIONS (WHICH WERE LATER MADE PUBLIC). IN SUMMARY THEY WERE:

- (I) WOULD PUNITIVE ACTION AGAINST SOUTH AFRICA BE LINKED TO ACTION AGAINST OTHER COUNTRIES WHERE RACIAL OR ETHNIC DIFFERENTIATION EXISTED?
- (II) WOULD THE EC CONDEMN AND SET TIME-SCALES FOR RESOLUTION OF ALL SITUATIONS WHICH WERE NOT TRULY DEMOCRATIC AND NON-RACIAL?
- (III) WOULD THE EC LAUNCH AN INTERNATIONAL CAMPAIGN TO SOLVE SIMULTANEOUSLY PROBLEMS IN ALL COUNTRIES EXPERIENCING A CONFLICT AS A RESULT OF RACIAL, ETHNIC OR RELIGIOUS TENSIONS?
- (IV) WOULD THEY LINK THE SOUTH AFRICAN SITUATION WITH SIMILAR QUESTIONS INVOLVING SIKHS, TAMILS, GURKHAS, ABORIGINES, MAORIS, NORTH AMERICAN INDIANS AND BASQUES?
- (V) WOULD THEY AGREE TO A COMMON APPROACH TO SO-CALLED POLITICAL PRISONERS IN COUNTRIES ALL OVER THE WORLD, SUCH AS SAKHAROV AND MAGEE?

3. OVER THREE DECADES THE SAG HAD MADE SOUTH AFRICA INTO A SHOWPIECE: ALL ITS COMMUNITIES HAD CONTRIBUTED TO THIS. THERE HAD BEEN NO ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FROM THE WORLD. SOUTH AFRICA WAS AN INDEPENDENT COUNTRY: AS LONG AS HE WAS ITS LEADER HE WOULD NOT ALLOW IT TO BE TREATED AS A COLONY. HE OBJECTED TO THE WORLD'S TREATMENT OF THE INDEPENDENT AND SELF-GOVERNING HOMELAND STATES. THE SECRETARY OF STATE HAD NOT TROUBLED TO SEE THE GOOD SIDE OF SOUTH AFRICA DURING HIS VISIT.

4. THE PRESS REPORTED THE SECRETARY OF STATE AS DOUBTING THAT THE SAG HAD THE COURAGE TO FREE MANDELA. SOUTH AFRICAN LEADERS WERE MORE COURAGEOUS THAN OTHER LEADERS. SOUTH AFRICA WAS ISOLATED BY THE APPLICATION OF DOUBLE STANDARDS. HE WOULD DEAL WITH MANDELA IN HIS OWN WAY: BUT HE WOULD HAVE TO OPENLY ABANDON VIOLENCE BEFORE HE COULD BE FREED.

2

CONFIDENTIAL

/this

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

THIS COULD NOT BE CONFUSED WITH 'SUSPENSION' OR 'HALTING' OF VIOLENCE. HE WOULD NOT BE FORCED INTO A LANCASTER HOUSE SITUATION. THE ANC MUST UNDERTAKE TO ABANDON VIOLENCE AND FREE THEMSELVES FROM COMMUNIST INFLUENCE BEFORE HE WOULD DEAL WITH THEM.

5. THERE WAS NOW A CLEAR ATTEMPT TO FORCE HIM TO MAKE A DECISION BETWEEN ACCEPTING THE RELEASE OF MANDELA AND THE UNBANNING OF THE ANC OR SANCTIONS. HE CHOSE SANCTIONS. HE HOPED WE WOULD ASK THE FLS TO APPLY THEM FIRST. IF THERE WERE SANCTIONS HE WOULD PREPARE SOUTH AFRICA FOR THAT FIGHT.

6. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT ON THIS ISSUE HE REPRESENTED A GOVERNMENT WHICH HAD DEMONSTRATED MORE SYMPATHY FOR SOUTH AFRICA'S POSITION, AND HAD DONE MORE TO REPRESENT THAT CASE THAN ALMOST ANY OTHER IN THE WORLD. IN MAKING THE CASE HE HAD COME TO MAKE ON BEHALF OF THE EC AND THE COMMONWEALTH, HE WAS PROBABLY THE MOST MODERATE IN STYLE AND SUBSTANCE OF ANY OF HIS EC COLLEAGUES. THE CASE HE HAD PRESENTED WAS FOUNDED ON THE SUPPORT OF ALL EC COUNTRIES AND THE UNITED STATES. WE MORE THAN ANY HAD RECOGNISED THE PROGRESS IN SOUTH AFRICA, AND HAD OFTEN BEEN DENOUNCED FOR IT. THE CASE HE ADVOCATED WAS ACCEPTED BY MANY HE HAD SPOKEN TO IN SOUTH AFRICA.

7. THE FIVE QUESTIONS THE PRESIDENT HAD ASKED SHOWED THE GAP OF PERCEPTION: FOR INSTANCE IN QUESTION (IV) ALL THE RACES NAMED WERE SITUATED IN COUNTRIES WITH FULL DEMOCRATIC PROCESSES. THIS WAS NOT THE CASE FOR THE BLACKS IN SOUTH AFRICA, WHO WERE NOT EVEN IN THE TRICAMERAL PARLIAMENT. SOUTH AFRICA'S ISOLATION WAS SELF-IMPOSED. MARKET DECISIONS TO STOP INVESTMENT HAD HAD MORE EFFECT THAN ANY GOVERNMENT-IMPOSED SANCTIONS. HE DENIED THAT THERE WERE DOUBLE STANDARDS: WE SAW THE SAG AS AN ENTITY WHICH CLAIMED AND INDEED DID TRY TO LIVE BY THE STANDARDS OF WESTERN CIVILISATION. THIS WAS WHY WE EXPECTED THEM TO ACT BY THOSE STANDARDS. HE URGED AGAIN THAT THE SAG SHOULD RECONSIDER THE FREEING OF MANDELA AND THE UNBANNING OF

3

CONFIDENTIAL

/ THE

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

THE ANC. THEY WERE OF COURSE PERFECTLY ENTITLED TO ASK THE LATTER FOR A MATCHING COMMITMENT TO PEACEFUL DIALOGUE.

8. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT MANDELA HAD BEEN PUT IN PRISON BY THE COURTS. WOULD THE BRITISH GOVERNMENT AGREE TO HOLD TALKS WITH PATRICK MAGEE? THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THERE WAS NO PARALLEL: IN THE UK, INCLUDING NORTHERN IRELAND, THERE WAS A FULL DEMOCRATIC PROCESS IN WHICH ALL COULD TAKE PART. THE PROBLEM FOR DIALOGUE WAS THAT EVEN THOSE LIKE BUTHELEZI WHO WERE FREE AND WANTED TO TAKE PART FELT THEY COULD NOT DO SO WHILE MANDELA AND OTHERS REMAINED IN JAIL. PRESIDENT BOTHA INTERRUPTED TO SAY THAT WE WERE THREATENING SANCTIONS TO DEAL WITH A BRITISH INTERNAL POLITICAL PROBLEM. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT THIS WAS NOT SO: OUR POSITION, THOUGH MORE UNDERSTANDING OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN SITUATION, WAS IN LINE WITH THAT OF OTHER WESTERN COUNTRIES: IT WAS PRESSURE THROUGHOUT THE WORLD WHICH WAS LEADING TOWARDS FURTHER SANCTIONS.

9. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT THE COMMONWEALTH WAS FULL OF MILITARY DICTATORSHIPS AND ONE PARTY STATES: WE SHOULD NOT PREACH TO HIM. DID WE CONSIDER GHANA AND UGANDA PERFECT? THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT WHATEVER THEIR DEFECTS, AND HE DID NOT DENY THEM, THESE COUNTRIES WERE NOT FOUNDED ON EXPLICIT RACIAL DISCRIMINATION WHICH ABSOLUTELY EXCLUDED THE MAJORITY OF PEOPLE FROM THE POLITICAL PROCESS. NOR DID THEY EXPRESSLY ASPIRE, AS DOES SOUTH AFRICA, TO WESTERN STANDARDS. WE HAD NOT COME TO EXPRESS VIEWS BECAUSE OF SOME DESTRUCTIVE MALICE, BUT IN THE HOPE OF ASSISTING PROGRESS. FOR THIS DIALOGUE WAS NEEDED. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT HE WAS IN FAVOUR OF DIALOGUE. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT NEVERTHELESS HE HAD NOT YET TAKEN THE STEPS NECESSARY TO MAKE EFFECTIVE DIALOGUE POSSIBLE.

10. PRESIDENT BOTHA INTERJECTED ANGRILY THAT THIS WAS A NONSENSICAL STATEMENT. HE HAD COLOURED PEOPLE IN HIS CABINET, WHICH COULD NOT BE SAID FOR THE UK. THE SECRETARY OF STATE POINTED OUT THAT THEY WERE NOMINATED MEMBERS.

4

CONFIDENTIAL

/HE

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

HE WENT ON TO SAY THAT PRESIDENT BOTHA HAD SET IN HAND A PROCESS OF CHANGE IN SOUTH AFRICA: THE US AND THE UK HAD BEEN ALMOST ALONE IN RECOGNISING THIS. BUT BECAUSE THE BLACK MAJORITY AS YET PLAYED NO PART IN GOVERNMENT, FURTHER STEPS WERE NEEDED. WHAT WAS NEEDED WAS A PROCESS WHICH WOULD COMMAND THE SUPPORT OF FREELY CHOSEN BLACK LEADERS. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT THE SAG WAS SO OVERWHELMED WITH BLACKS WHO WISHED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE WORK OF THE NATIONAL STATUTORY COUNCIL THAT IT WOULD TAKE THEM A LONG TIME EVEN TO SORT OUT THE APPLICATIONS. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT SUCCESS NEEDED THE PARTICIPATION OF ALL PARTIES: IF THE SOUTH AFRICANS WOULD FREE THE BANNED BLACK POLITICAL PARTIES THEY WOULD BE ENTITLED TO ASK FOR A HALT TO VIOLENCE AND THE BEGINNING OF PEACEFUL DIALOGUE. PRESIDENT BOTHA REVERTED TO HIS EARLIER REMARKS ABOUT PATRICK MAGEE. HE SAID THAT WE SHOULD APPLY SANCTIONS AGAINST COUNTRIES SUCH AS GHANA AND NIGERIA.

11. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT THIS WAS NOT THE ISSUE. HE HAD JUST READ THE WORDS OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONSTITUTION ON THE WALL OF PRESIDENT BOTHA'S OUTER OFFICE. THEY CONTAINED ALL THE PRINCIPLES OF WESTERN LIBERAL DEMOCRACY. ALL WE WERE ASKING WAS THAT THEY BE FULLY APPLIED. PRESIDENT BOTHA CLAIMED THAT THE BASE OF THE SAG HAD BEEN GREATLY BROADENED. HE HAD HIMSELF SAID THAT APARTHEID WAS OUT-MODED. HE HAD DONE AWAY WITH THE INFLUX CONTROL MEASURES. APARTHEID WAS IN MANY WAYS A LEGACY OF BRITISH RULE. WE SHOULD ENCOURAGE THE SAG, NOT TREAT THEM AS LEPERS. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT WE HAD COMMENDED THE CHANGES WHICH HAD BEEN MADE. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT THE SECRETARY OF STATE HAD NOT DONE SO: INSTEAD HE THREATENED SANCTIONS. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID HE HAD NOT DONE THIS: WHAT HE HAD DESCRIBED WAS A LIKELY EVOLUTION OF THE SITUATION, WHETHER WE LIKED IT OR NOT. IF FURTHER MEASURES WERE ADOPTED MANY OF THE STATES TAKING THEM WOULD DO SO WITH GREAT SADNESS. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT HE RECEIVED MANY LETTERS FROM ALL OVER THE COMMONWEALTH

5

CONFIDENTIAL

SUPPORTING

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

SUPPORTING HIS STANCE. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT NEVERTHELESS THE POLITICAL PRESSURE WAS IN THE OTHER DIRECTION. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT IT WAS CLEAR THAT WE HAD SET THE PACE. THE SOONER SANCTIONS WERE APPLIED THE BETTER. IN THE END THEY WOULD STRENGTHEN SOUTH AFRICA AS HAD PREVIOUS MEASURES. SOUTH AFRICANS WOULD FIGHT WITH SELF-RESPECT. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT SOME IN SOUTH AFRICA MIGHT FEEL ABLE TO GO IT ALONE, BUT THE COST WOULD BE VERY GREAT. MANY IN SOUTH AFRICA FEARED THE CONSEQUENCES.

12. PRESIDENT BOTHA COMPLAINED THAT THE EC HAD SHOWN INTEREST ONLY IN THE FREEING OF MANDELA AND THE UNBANNING OF THE ANC. THEY IGNORED HIS ACHIEVEMENTS. IT WAS NOTICEABLE THAT HE HAD TREATED THE SECRETARY OF STATE DECENTLY, UNLIKE PRESIDENT KAUNDA. THE SECRETARY OF STATE REMINDED HIM THAT THE REASON FOR HIS BAD RECEPTION IN ZAMBIA WAS THAT HE WAS THOUGHT TO BE CONSPIRING WITH THE SAG. PRESIDENT BOTHA REPEATED THAT THE SECRETARY OF STATE WAS NOW IN A CIVILISED COUNTRY, UNLIKE OTHERS.

13. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT IT WAS THE CONSIDERED VIEW OF THE COUNTRIES HE REPRESENTED THAT THE FUTURE OF SOUTH AFRICA MUST BE FOUNDED ON DIALOGUE. WE WERE PREPARED TO PRESS ON BLACK LEADERS THE NEED TO MAKE A MATCHING COMMITMENT TO PEACEFUL DIALOGUE IF THE SAG WOULD MAKE IT POSSIBLE. HE HAD COMMENDED THE COURAGE AND TENACITY OF THE AFRIKANER NATION, WHICH WE HAD GOOD REASON TO KNOW AS WE HAD FOUGHT BOTH AGAINST AND ALONGSIDE THEM, AND HAD RECOGNISED THAT THE STEPS WHICH HAD BEEN TAKEN HAD REQUIRED COURAGE. HE HAD NOT, AS THE PRESIDENT ALLEGED, SAID THAT THE SAG LACKED COURAGE, BUT HAD ACKNOWLEDGED THE COURAGE WHICH HAD BEEN REQUIRED IN THE STEPS ALREADY TAKEN, AND RECOGNISED THE NEED FOR STILL FURTHER COURAGE IN ORDER TO ENABLE DIALOGUE TO TAKE PLACE.

14. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT INSTEAD OF LOOKING AT THE REAL SOUTH AFRICA, THE SECRETARY OF STATE HAD TOURED NEIGHBOURING STATES IN ORDER TO EXPLAIN TO THEM THE NEED

6

CONFIDENTIAL

/ For

CONFIDENTIAL

53335 - 1

FOR SANCTIONS AGAINST SOUTH AFRICA. THE SECRETARY OF STATE SAID THAT THIS WAS A TOTAL MISUNDERSTANDING: HE WANTED TO SEE FOR HIMSELF JUST HOW BADLY THEY WOULD BE AFFECTED BY SANCTIONS, SO THAT HE COULD EXPLAIN THAT POINT TO OTHERS. PRESIDENT BOTHA SAID THAT WE SHOULD NOT PREACH TO HIM ABOUT WHAT OUGHT TO BE DONE. HE WOULD DO IT HIS WAY, WHETHER OR NOT WE APPLIED SANCTIONS. HE WOULD NOT BE SHOUTED AT BY THE WORLD. THE WEST SHOULD NOT BE FEARFUL: SOUTH AFRICA WOULD STILL BE THERE WHEN THE WEST NEEDED IT AGAIN.  
15. FINALLY HE ASKED FOR HIS REGARDS TO BE CONVEYED TO THE PRIME MINISTER.

HOWE

OCMIAN 3335

SOUTHERN AFRICA  
STANDARD (PALACE)  
SAFD  
OADs  
UNL  
NAD  
ECDs  
SOVIET D  
MR REEVE  
CABINET OFFICE

[COPIES SENT TO NO 10 DOWNING STREET]

ADDITIONAL DISTRIBUTION  
SOUTHERN AFRICA

-4-  
CONFIDENTIAL